## A Story with No Ending: Penelope and Ambiguous Loss in the Odyssey

1) Interview with the former wife of a MIA soldier (quoted by Hunter 1988, 323)

"I've come to realize that his remains have not been returned so there is no finality to it. Also, all the news in the papers recently [about the possibility of American POWs still being held in Southeast Asia after the war ended] has upset me. I didn't know I was still vulnerable. [...] What if he were still there? I can't even think about it! [...] Looking at this thing 10 years later, I feel less removed now than I did, say, seven years after Homecoming."

2) Psychological father presence (*Od.* 1.113-117)

τὴν δὲ πολὺ πρῶτος ἴδε Τηλέμαχος θεοειδής· ἡστο γὰρ ἐν μνηστῆρσι φίλον τετιημένος ἦτορ, ἀσσόμενος πατέρ' ἐσθλὸν ἐνὶ φρεσίν, εἴ ποθεν ἐλθὼν μνηστήρων τῶν μὲν σκέδασιν κατὰ δώματα θείη, τιμὴν δ' αὐτὸς ἔχοι καὶ κτήμασιν οἱσιν ἀνάσσοι.

Godlike Telemachus was the very first to see her, for he was sitting among the suitors, with sorrow in his heart, seeing with his mind's eye his noble father, if he, coming from elsewhere, should scatter the suitors in the halls, and he himself should have honor and be lord of his possessions.

3) Penelope interrupts Phemius' song (*Od.* 1.340-344)

"ταύτης δ' ἀποπαύε' ἀοιδῆς (340) λυγρῆς, ἥ τέ μοι **αἰὲν** ἐνὶ στήθεσσι φίλον κῆρ τείρει, ἐπεί με μάλιστα καθίκετο πένθος ἄλαστον. τοίην γὰρ κεφαλὴν ποθέω μεμνημένη **αἰεὶ** ἀνδρός, τοῦ κλέος εὐρὺ καθ' Ἑλλάδα καὶ μέσον Ἄργος."

"But cease from this painful song, which **always** wears out my heart in my breast, since unforgettable grief touches me most of all. For I **constantly** remember and long for such a face, the face of my husband, whose fame reaches far in Greece and mid-Argos."

4) Penelope cries herself to sleep (*Od.* 1.363-364; cf. 16.450-451, 19.603-604, 21.357-358)

κλαῖεν ἔπειτ' Ὀδυσῆα, φίλον πόσιν, ὄφοα οἱ ὕπνον ἡδὺν ἐπὶ βλεφάροισι βάλε γλαυκῶπις Ἀθήνη.

Then she wept for Odysseus, her dear husband, until grey-eyed Athena cast sweet sleep upon her eyelids.

CAMWS: Women & War Trauma Panel April 12, 2018

5) Penelope's "frozen grief" thaws (Od. 19.204-209)

της δ' ἄρ' ἀκουούσης ὁὲε δάκρυα, τήκετο δὲ χρώς.

ώς δὲ χιὼν κατατήκετ' ἐν ἀκροπόλοισιν ὄρεσσιν,

ήν τ' εὖρος κατέτηξεν, ἐπὴν ζέφυρος καταχεύῃ,

τηκομένης δ' ἄρα της ποταμοὶ πλήθουσι ὁἑοντες·

ὼς της τήκετο καλὰ παρήϊα δάκρυ χεούσης,

κλαιούσης ἑὸν ἄνδρα, παρήμενον.

As she listened, her tears flowed, and her face melted. As snow melts on the high peaks of mountains, snow that the East wind thaws when the West wind pours it down, and while it melts, the rivers are full with flowing water, so her lovely cheeks melted with tears pouring down, as she cried for her husband, although he sat beside her.

6) Penelope's resilience (*Od.* 19.576-581, cf. 21.74-79)

"νῦν δὲ μνηστή ρεσσιν ἄεθλον τοῦτον ἐφήσω·

ος δέ κε ὁηἵτατ' ἐντανύση βιὸν ἐν παλάμησι
καὶ διοϊστεύση πελέκεων δυοκαίδεκα πάντων,
τῷ κεν ἄμ' ἑσποίμην, νοσφισσαμένη τόδε δῶμα
κουρίδιον, μάλα καλόν, ἐνίπλειον βιότοιο,
τοῦ ποτε μεμνήσεσθαι ὀἵομαι ἔν περ ὀνείρω."

(580)

"But now I will set this contest for the suitors: whoever most easily strings the bow in his hands and shoots an arrow through all twelves axes, him I would follow, leaving behind the house of my marriage, a house especially fine and filled with wealth, which, I think, I will always remember, even in my dreams."

7) Penelope's conflicting emotions (*Od.* 20.79-82)

"ὡς ἔμ' ἀϊστώσειαν Ὀλύμπια δώματ' ἔχοντες, ἠέ μ' ἐϋπλόκαμος βάλοι Ἅρτεμις, ὄφρ' Ὀδυσῆα (80) ὀσσομένη καὶ γαῖαν ὕπο στυγερὴν ἀφικοίμην, μηδέ τι χείρονος ἀνδρὸς ἐϋφραίνοιμι νόημα."

So may those who dwell on Olympus make me disappear, or may Artemis with the beautiful hair shoot me, so that **with Odysseus in my mind's eye** I may arrive beneath the hateful earth, and may never delight the mind of a man worse than him.

CAMWS: Women & War Trauma Panel April 12, 2018

8) Penelope fetches the bow (*Od.* 21.42-50, 67)

ή δ' ὅτε δὴ θάλαμον τὸν ἀφίκετο δῖα γυναικῶν οὐδόν τε δούϊνον προσεβήσετο, τόν ποτε τέκτων ξέσσεν ἐπισταμένως καὶ ἐπὶ στάθμην ἴθυνεν, έν δὲ σταθμοὺς ἄρσε, θύρας δ' ἐπέθηκε φαεινάς, αὐτίκ' ἄρ' ἥ γ' ἱμάντα θοῶς ἀπέλυσε κορώνης, έν δὲ κληίδ' ἡκε, θυρέων δ' ἀνέκοπτεν ὀχῆας άντα τιτυσκομένη. τὰ δ' ἀνέβραχεν ἠΰτε ταῦρος βοσκόμενος λειμώνι· τόσ' ἔβραχε καλὰ θύρετρα πληγέντα κληίδι, πετάσθησαν δέ οἱ ἀκα. ... αὐτίκα δὲ μνηστήρσι μετηύδα καὶ φάτο μῦθον.

(45)

When she, dazzling among women, came to the storeroom, and stepped upon the threshold of oak, which once upon a time a carpenter had skillfully planed and trued to the line, and fitted door-posts on it, and set bright doors on them, immediately, behold!, she quickly loosed the strap from the hook, and thrust in the key, and with true aim shot back the bolts of the door. And as a bull bellows when grazing in a meadow, so bellowed the beautiful doors when struck with the key, and they quickly flew open before her.

... and **immediately** she spoke among the suitors and made this speech.

## Selected Bibliography

- Amory, A. 1963. "The Reunion of Odysseus and Penelope." In *Essays on the Odyssey*, edited by C. H. Taylor, 100–121. Bloomington, IN.
- Arthur, M. B. 1973. "Early Greece: The Origins of the Western Attitude Toward Women." *Arethusa* 6: 7–58.
- Boss, P. 1999. Ambiguous Loss: Learning to Live with Unresolved Grief. Cambridge, MA.
- Boss, P. 2006. Loss, Trauma, and Resilience: Therapeutic Work with Ambiguous Loss. New York.
- Carson, A. 2005. "Every Exit Is an Entrance." In *Decreation: Poetry, Essays, Opera*, 27–29. New York.
- Doherty, L. E. 1995. Siren Songs: Gender, Audiences, and Narrators in the Odyssey. Ann Arbor, MI.
- Foley, H. P. 1978. "Reverse Similes' and Sex Roles in the Odyssey." *Arethusa* 11: 7–26.
- Foley, H. P. 1995. "Penelope as Moral Agent." In *The Distaff Side: Representing the Female in Homer's Odyssey*, edited by B. Cohen, 93–115. Oxford.
- Hunter, E. J. 1988. "Long-Term Effects of Parental Wartime Captivity on Children of POW and MIA Servicemen." *Journal of Contemporary Psychotherapy* 18: 312-328.
- Marquardt, P. 1985. "Penelope 'Polutropos." AJP 106: 32–48.
- Mueller, M. 2007. "Penelope and the Poetics of Remembering." Arethusa 40: 337–362.
- Pache, C. 2014. "Women after War: Weaving Nostos in Homeric Epic and in the Twenty-First Century." In *Combat Trauma and the Ancient Greeks*, edited by P. Meineck and D. Konstan, 67–85. New York.
- Race, W. H. 1993. "First Appearances in the Odyssey." TAPA 123: 79-107.
- Race, W. H. 2014. "Phaeacian Therapy in Homer's *Odyssey*." In *Combat Trauma and the Ancient Greeks*, edited by P. Meineck and D. Konstan, 47–66. New York.
- Shay, J. 1994. Achilles in Vietnam: Combat Trauma and the Undoing of Character. New York.
- Shay, J. 2002. Odysseus in America: Combat Trauma and the Trials of Homecoming. New York.
- Thalmann, W. G. 1984. Conventions of Form and Thought in Early Greek Epic Poetry. Baltimore.
- Turkeltaub, D. 2015. "Penelope's Lion, Θυμολέων Husband, and Θυμός-Destroying Pain." *CJ* 110: 279–302.