

Playing the Author: Creative Analysis in Classical Literature Courses
 Reina E. Callier – University of Colorado at Boulder
 reina.callier@colorado.edu
 CAMWS 2018, Albuquerque

Passage 1 – *In Defense of the Kardashians*:

Student A's Creative Paper	Cicero's <i>Pro Caelio</i>
<p>Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, why we are gathered here today can only be described as undoubtedly ludicrous. You, hardworking, important, upstanding members of society, have been forced to take time out of your important, busy lives to decide if the Kardashians are to be found guilty on all counts of... honestly... I don't even know what they are being accused of...As a friend of their father, Robert Kardashian, I find it rather inconceivable that his children would ever be nothing but upstanding members of our society, upholding its morals and laws. If they are being accused of being too famous, I chalk it up to each and every one of you making them that way. If they are being accused of being too focused on issues that don't actually matter to anyone not rich, I say that that was how they were raised and you can't blame them for having no other role models. Any way you spin it, this trial is a joke, orchestrated by a jealous elite who I will give no such thought to, as to not give them any free publicity, and who must be vigorously opposed at all costs...</p> <p>...Enough about them, let's talk about the person accusing them of these deeds. She is known as the Medea of Hollywood, a "Regina George in sheep's clothing" if you will. This trial only came to fruition because of one person: Taylor Swift...The defense will not stoop to the level of Ms. Swift, for she is not a bad person inherently...All I ask is for Taylor to help me answer a question, since she is the main witness and driving force of this trial. Would you let someone, someone very unlike yourself, might I emphasize, besmirch your name, mention anywhere they can, all while they make a profit off of it? An example of this would be to allude</p>	<p>[1-2] If, members of the jury, there should happen to be present among us here today anyone who is unfamiliar with our laws, courts, and way of doing things, I am sure he would wonder what terrible enormity this case involves...If he were then to be told that no crime, no enormity, and no act of violence has been brought before the court, but that a brilliantly able, hard-working, and popular young man is being accused by the son of someone he has prosecuted...he would consider that a woman's passions should be kept under control, and he would conclude that you yourselves are overworked, since even on a public holiday you are not allowed the day off!...I shall forgive Atratinus, however, a civilized and altogether excellent young man and a friend of mine...If he brought the charge voluntarily, I put it down to his sense of filial duty, if he was acting under orders, I put it down to compulsion, and if he expected to gain something from it, I put it down to his youthful naivety. As for the other accusers, they deserve no such indulgence, and must be vigorously opposed.</p> <p>...[18] For you will find out, gentlemen, what I shall show you when I come to that point – that this Medea of the Palatine and the change of residence was the cause of all this young man's difficulties...[50] I am forgetting the wrongs you have done me, Clodia...So do not think what I said was directed against you. But I do want you to answer me this yourself, since the prosecution declare that you are responsible for the charge, and that you are also their witness for it. If a woman did exist like the one I have just been describing, a woman quite unlike yourself I hasten to add, one with the life and habits of a prostitute, would you consider it so very shocking and disgraceful if a</p>

to them in a book or a song for instance. Would this be a trustworthy person for this trial? Would someone who does this have enough credibility in a court of law? Perhaps your own moral decency will show that the Kardashians have not acted immorally, or through your complete and utter lack of decency will provide us with ample means to justify their behavior.	young man should have had some dealings with her? If, then, you are not this woman, as I prefer to believe, what criticism can the prosecution possibly make of Caelius?...Either your own fundamental decency will make it clear that Caelius has not acted immorally, or else your utter lack of decency will provide both him and all the rest with ample means of justifying their behavior.
--	--

Passage 2: Student A's Analytical Paper

I started my paper out the same way Cicero started [the *Pro Caelio*]. He spent the whole first part of his opening statement praising the jury and bringing up the fact that he thought it was insane for all these very important men to take time out of their day to sit at a trial that should not be happening. In my opener, I tried to do the same, talking about how stupid it was for these women to even be on trial... I also brought up Robert Kardashian, who was a well known defense lawyer...as a source of credibility. I noticed Cicero does that a lot in all of his speeches. He ties the people he is defending or prosecuting to other people who the jury will find as either adding credibility or taking away from it. At the beginning of his speech, he gives a blanket defense, basically summarizing everything Caelius is accused of into three main arguments: He was either acting under filial duty, compulsion, or youthful naivety. I did the same at the end of my opening paragraph, saying it was either not their fault or society made them that way.

I tried to do what Cicero did with Clodia...I chose her as the one who started this whole trial because of their public feuds recently, and also Taylor Swift has a reputation I could easily make fun of in the same way he did when he insinuated that Clodia was a prostitute. I directly quoted Cicero when he called Clodia the Medea of Palatine, except I changed it Medea of Hollywood. I tried to build up an argument discrediting her credibility. I did the technique with her songs where you say you aren't going to talk about something, but by bringing it up in the first place, you are talking about it. I then used the exact same technique Cicero uses, where he asks Clodia if the word of a prostitute should be considered trustworthy but insists he's not calling her one, with her songs. This is meant to discredit her whole prosecution...

Passage 3 – *Against Jay-Z*:

Student B's Creative Paper	Cicero's <i>First Catilinarian</i>
How far, I ask you, Jay-Z, do you mean to stretch our patience? Is material wealth not enough for you? How broadly do your appetites extend? Do you think your plans go undetected? How often did you sneak out in the night to your mistress, thinking your wife dull and blind? Time and again I am reminded, through no wish of my own, that duplicity is inherent to the nature of man. And what agony upon innocent	[1-2] How far, I ask you, Catiline, do you mean to stretch our patience? How much longer will your frenzy continue to frustrate us? At what point will your unrestrained recklessness stop flaunting itself?...Do you not realize that your plans have been exposed? Do you not see that your conspiracy has been arrested and trapped, now that all these people know about it? What a decadent age we live in! The senate is aware of

<p>wives that it wrecks! Oh, the times. Oh, their failing morality!...</p> <p>... I entreat you now to divert your attention from the man in question, as I, for one, can no longer look at him. Soothe your weary eyes instead with a vision of the father of Beyoncé, that strong exemplum of Roman ideals, who so loved his study of texts and the fittings of glorious war, and join me now as I imagine his woe over recent events. Thus her father, speaking in Beyoncé’s ear: I warn you about men like him, men like me, and indeed all men. When bad men appear, you must fell them. Take care of your mother; watch out for your sister too. Do not cry, but be strong; for when I am gone, unlikely though it may sound, ‘twill be you who becomes man of the house; you who must care for the women here, for without sons I deem you the strongest. Yes, my child: it is you who must stand guard, and refuse the lechery and duplicity of the men who surround you.</p>	<p>these things, the consul sees them – yet this man remains alive!...</p> <p>...[27] Now, conscript fathers...please pay careful attention to what I am going to say, and store it deep inside your hearts and minds. Imagine that my country, which is much more precious to me than my own life, imagine that all Italy, imagine that the entire nation were to address me like this: “Marcus Tullius, what are you playing at? Are you going to permit the departure of a man whom you have discovered to be a public enemy?...[28] Although you are known only for what you have done yourself, and do not have distinguished ancestors to recommend you, the Roman people have nevertheless seen fit to raise you...to the supreme power. Fine thanks you will be paying them in return, then, if you neglect the safety of your fellow-citizens through concern for your reputation or fear of any kind of danger!”</p>
---	--

Passage 4: Student B’s Analytical Paper

Aspects of Cicero’s rhetorical devices which I employed include hyperbole, rhetorical questions, exempla, prosopopoeia, apostrophe, ascending clauses of complexity, and thesis, among several others... I used rhetorical questions often throughout the piece in order to illustrate the gravity of a point, another hallmark of Cicero’s work. The opening, of course, is a close transplant of ‘Against Catiline’ with its repetitive questioning...next, one can look to the use of apostrophe, which I used here in a very similar way to how Cicero can be seen to use it in ‘Against Catiline.’ The most prominent example is the opening line: ‘How far, I ask you, Jay-Z, do you mean to stretch our patience?’ Though apostrophe can be used in a Ciceronian oration to address both a person who is present and a person who is not, it is used exclusively in this assignment for those who are in the room at the time of the speech...

... Prosopopoeia is...seen in the section where the speaker assumes the voice of Beyoncé’s deceased father. The advice the speaker-as-father imparts is, naturally, rooted in the lyrics of a song on Beyoncé’s album which details her father’s warnings about duplicitous men...The use of *prosopopoeia* in ‘Against Catiline’ [occurs] when the speaker says that Rome called out for his assistance. Such assumption of the voice of another can intensify the immediacy of an oration, and has been used here, as Cicero often used it, to impart some moral message upon the listener.

Select Bibliography

- Baer, John and Garrett, Tracey. 2017. "Accountability, the Common Core, and Creativity," in *Nurturing Creativity in the Classroom* (2nd Edition), edd. Ronald A. Beghetto and James C. Kaufman. Cambridge University Press.
- Crimmel, Hal. 1996. "Prudes and Conservatives; or, Everyone Does It But Literature Teachers: Creative Writing Assignments," by Hal Crimmel. Presented at the Meeting of the Conference on College Composition and Communication (47th, Milwaukee, WI, March 27-30).
- Cummins, Amy. 2009. "Tell Me a Story: Effective Use of Creative Writing Assignments in College Literature Courses," in *Currents in Teaching and Learning*, Vol. 1 No. 2.
- Graham, Lea and Peterson, Janine. 2015. "Teaching Historical Analysis through Creative Writing Assignments," *College Teaching*, 63:4, 153-161.
- Gellar-Goad, T.H.M. 2014. "Gender, Performance, Pedagogy," in *Cloelia N.S.* Vol.4.
- Knox, Peter E. and McKeown, J.C. 2013. *The Oxford Anthology of Roman Literature*. Oxford University Press.