

The Stylistic Links Between Archaisms and Rhythm in Sallust's *Bellum Catilinae*

Claire Trivax, *University of Wisconsin-Madison*

trivax@wisc.edu

CAMWS Annual Meeting

Albuquerque, NM

April 13, 2018

Handout 1: Cicero, *De Oratore*¹, on Senatorial Deliberative Oratory

1A. Atque haec in senatu **minore apparatu** agenda sunt; sapiens enim est consilium multisque aliis dicendi relinquendus locus, **vitanda etiam ingeni ostentationis suspicio: contio capit omnem vim orationis et gravitatem varietatemque desiderat.** Ergo in suadendo nihil est optabilius quam dignitas; nam qui utilitatem petit, non quid maxime velit suasor, sed quid interdum magis sequatur, videt. (2.233-4)

1B. Controversia autem est inter hominum sententias aut in illo, utrum sit utilius; aut etiam, cum id convenit, certatur, utrum honestati potius an utilitati consulendum sit; quae quia pugnare inter se saepe videntur, qui utilitatem defendet, enumerabit commoda pacis, opum, potentiae, vectigalium, praesidi militum, ceterarum rerum, quarum fructum utilitate metimur, itemque incommoda contrariorum; **qui ad dignitatem impellit, maiorum exempla, quae erant vel cum periculo gloriosa, colliget, posteritatis immortalem memoriam augebit,** utilitatem ex laude nasci defendet semperque eam cum dignitate esse coniunctam. (2.235-6)

1A. And these can be done in the senate **with less ornament**; For the deliberative body is wise and one must leave a place for many others to speak, **furthermore avoid suspicion of a display of cleverness. The contio takes all the power and weightiness of oratory, and had desired variety.** Therefore, nothing in persuading is more desirable than dignity. For the one who seeks expediency, he sees not what his advisor most wants, but more what immediately follows. (2.233-4)

1B. But there is a dispute among the opinions of men or in that, which of the two is more expedient, or even, when it does agree, it is disputed whether there should be more regard for integrity or expediency; since these things often seem to conflict with each other, the one who defends expediency, will list off the advantages of peace, wealth, power, of taxes, of military defense, of other things, whose success we measure by expediency, likewise the disadvantages of the opposites; **the one who drives (us) towards dignity, will collect examples of the ancestors, which were glorious, even with danger, and will increase the immortal memory of posterity,** maintains that expediency is born from praise and that it is always connected with dignity. (2.235-6)

Handout 2: *Comparanda* for Ablative Phrases in Caesar

eodemque tempore toto muro clamore sublato... (BG. 7.24.3)

qui bello Cassiano... (BG. 1.13.2).

omni Gallia devicta (BG 8.1.1)

Bellicosissimis gentibus devictis (BG. 8.24.1).

Handout 3: Quintilian on the Judgement of the Ear

optime autem de illa iudicant aures, quae plena sentiunt et parum expleta desiderant, et fragosis offenduntur, levibus mulcentur, contortis excitantur, et stabilia probant, clauda deprendunt, redundantia ac nimia fastidiunt, (9.4.116)

But the ears judge about that [composition/rhythm] the best, which senses fullness and lacks too little the completed, and is offended by unevenness, is appeased by smoothness, is excited by the energetic, and approves of stability, recognizes the defective, and is made weary by redundancy and excess. (9.4.116)

¹ Texts of Cicero and Quintilian were from the Loeb edition, and *BC* was taken from the Teubner (1957) edition of the text. All translations are my own.

Handout 4: ABCba Exempla Pattern in BC. 51

1.(A) Bellō Mācēdōnicō: quod cum rege Perse gessimus, Rhodiorum civitas magna atque magnifica, quae populi Romani opibus creverat, infida et advorsa nobis fuit.

2. Sed postquam bello confecto de Rhodiis consultum est, maiores nostri, ne quis divitiarum magis quam iniuriae causa bellum inceptum diceret, inpunitos eos dimiseret. (51.5)

3.(B) ītēm: bellis Pūnicis omnībūs, cum saepe Carthaginenses, et in pace et per indutias, multa nefaria facinora fecissent, numquam ipsi per occasionem talia fecere: magis, quid se dignum foret, quam quid in illos iure fieri posset, quaerebant. (51.6)

4.(C) Lācēdaēmōnī: devictis Athēnēnsībūs triginta viros inposuere, qui rem publicam eorum tractarent. (51.28)

5. Li primo coepere pessimum quemque et omnibus invisum indemnatum necare: ea populus laetari et merito dicere fieri. Post, ubi paulatim licentia crevit, iuxta bonos et malos lubricose interficere, ceteros metu terrere: ita civitas servitute oppressa stultae laetitiae gravis poenas dedit. (51.29-31)

6.(a) nōstrā mēmōriā, victor Sulla cum Damasippum et alios eius modi, qui malo rei publicae creverant, iugulari iussit, quis non factum eius laudabat? (51.32)

7. Homines scelestos et factiosos, qui seditionibus rem publicam exagitaverant, merito necatos aiebant. Sed ea res magnae initium cladis fuit. Nam uti quisque domum aut villam, postremo vas aut vestimentum alicuius concupiverat, dabat operam, ut is in proscriptorum numero esset. Ita illi, quibus Damasippi mors laetitiae fuerat, paulo post ipsi trahebantur neque prius finis iugulandi fuit, quam Sulla omnis suos divitiis explevit. (51.32-4)

8.(b) Sēd: ēōd^{em} illō tēpōrē Graeciae morem imitati verberibus animadvortebant in civis, de condemnatis summum supplicium sumebant. (51.39)

9. Postquam res publica adolevit et multitudine civium factiones valere, circumveniri innocentes, alia huiusmodi fieri coepere, tum lex Porcia aliaeque leges paratae sunt, quibus legibus exsilium damnatis permissum est. (51.40)

1.(A) During the Macedonian war, which we waged with king Perse, the great and magnificent citizenry of the Rhodians, which increased by the resources of the Roman people, and was unfaithful and hostile to us.

2. But after the war had been completed, it was decided about the Rhodians that, our ancestors, lest someone say that the war was begun by a cause for their riches more than for the offense, sent them away unpunished. (51.5)

3.(B) Likewise, during all of the Punic wars, although often the Carthaginians, both in peace and through treaties, committed many horrible deeds, never did those ones [Romans] through opportunity do such things: the asked more what would be proper for themselves than what could be done against those with a law. (51.6)

4.(C) The Lacedaemonians, with the Athenians defeated, placed thirty men, who ruled the Republic of them. (51.28)

5. These men first began to put to death the most wicked who were hated by everyone without a trial; this the people rejoiced at and said that it was done with merit. After, when their freedom gradually increased, they killed good and bad alike at their pleasure, and terrorized the rest with fear: Thus, the citizenry, oppressed by slavery, paid a heavy penalty for its foolish rejoicing. (51.29-30)

6.(a) Within our memory, when the conqueror Sulla, ordered Damasippus and the others of this kind, who prospered due to the corruption of the state, to be killed, who would not praise the deed of him? (51.32)

7. The men said that the seditious criminals, who harassed the Republic with civil discord, died with merit. But that matter was the beginning of great bloodshed. For as whoever desired the home or villa, last of all the vase and clothing of another, he gave effort, so that they would be in the number of the proscribed. Thus, those ones, who rejoiced at the death of Damasippus, were themselves after a little while dragged off and there was no end to the killing until Sulla filled up his all his own followers with riches.

8.(b) But, at that same time, they, [Romans] having imitated the custom of Greece, began to punish the citizens with scourging and take up the supreme punishment for the condemned. (51.39)

9. Afterwards, when the Republic matured and because of the multitude of the citizens, factions prevailed, they began to circumvent the innocent people, and other things of this kind were done, then the *Lex Porcia* and other laws were enacted, by which laws allowed exile for the convicted. (51.40)

Handout 5: Full Text of BC. 51

[1] Omnis homines, patres conscripti, qui de rebus dubiis consultant, ab odio, amicitia, ira atque misericordia vacuos esse decet. [2] Haud facile animus verum providet, ubi illa officiant, neque quisquam omnium lubidini simul et usui paruit. [3] Ubi intenderis ingenium, valet; si libido possidet, ea dominatur, animus nihil valet. [4] Magna mihi copia est memorandi, patres conscripti, quae reges atque populi ira aut misericordia impulsu male consuluerint. Sed ea malo dicere, quae maiores nostri contra lubidinem animi sui recte atque ordine fecere. [5] **Bello Macedonico**, quod cum rege Perse gessimus, Rhodiorum civitas magna atque magnifica, quae populi Romani opibus creverat, infida et advorsa nobis fuit. Sed postquam bello confecto de Rhodiis consultum est, maiores nostri, ne quis divitiarum magis quam iniuriae causa bellum inceptum diceret, inpunitos eos dimiserunt. [6] **Item bellis Punicis omnibus**, cum saepe Carthaginenses et in pace et per indutias multa nefaria facinora fecissent, numquam ipsi per occasionem talia fecere: magis, quid se dignum foret, quam quid in illos iure fieri posset, quaerebant. [7] Hoc item vobis providendum est, patres conscripti, ne plus apud vos valeat P. Lentuli et ceterorum scelus quam vestra dignitas neu magis irae vestrae quam famae consulatis. [8] Nam si digna poena pro factis eorum reperitur, novum consilium adprobo; sin magnitudo sceleris omnium ingenia exsuperat, his utendum censeo, quae legibus comparata sunt.

[9] Plerique eorum, qui ante me sententias dixerunt, compositae atque magnifice casum rei publicae miserati sunt. Quae belli saevitia esset, quae victis acciderent, enumerare: rapti virgines, pueros, divelli liberos a parentum complexu, matres familiarum pati, quae victoribus conlubuissent, fana atque domos spoliari, caedem, incendia fieri, postremo armis, cadaveribus, cruore atque luctu omnia conpleri. 10 Sed per deos immortalis, quo illa oratio pertinuit? An uti vos infestis coniurationi faceret? Scilicet, quem res tanta et tam atrox non permovet, eum oratio accendit. 11 Non ita est neque cuiquam mortalium iniuriae suae parvae videntur; multi eas gravius aequo habere. 12 Sed alia aliis licentia est, patres conscripti. Qui demissi in obscuro vitam habent, si quid iracundia deliquere, pauci sciunt: fama atque fortuna eorum pares sunt; qui magno imperio praediti in excelso aetatem agunt, eorum facta cuncti mortales novere. 13 Ita in maxuma fortuna minima licentia est; neque studere neque odisse, sed minime irasci decet; 14 quae apud alios iracundia dicitur, ea in imperio superbia atque crudelitas appellatur. 15 Equidem ego sic existimo, patres conscripti, omnis cruciatus minores quam facinora illorum esse. Sed plerique mortales postrema meminere et in hominibus impiis sceleris eorum obliti de poena disserunt, si ea paulo severior fuit.

[16] D. Silanum, virum fortem atque strenuum, certo scio, quae dixerit, studio rei publicae dixisse neque illum in tanta re gratiam aut inimicitias exercere: eos mores eamque modestiam viri cognovi. [17] Verum sententia eius mihi non crudelis – quid enim in talis homines crudele fieri potest? – sed aliena a re publica nostra videtur. [18] Nam profecto aut metus aut iniuria te subegit, Silane, consulem designatum genus poenae novum decernere. [19] De timore supervacaneum est disserere, cum praesertim diligentia clarissimi viri consulis tanta praesidia sint in armis. [20] De poena possum equidem dicere, id quod res habet, in luctu atque miseriis mortem aerumnarum requiem, non cruciatum esse; eam cuncta mortalium mala dissolvere; ultra neque curae neque gaudio locum esse. [21] Sed, per deos immortalis, quam ob rem in sententiam non addidisti, uti prius verberibus in eos animadvorteretur? [22] An quia lex Porcia vetat? At aliae leges item condemnatis civibus non animam eripi, sed exsilium permitti iubent. An quia gravius est verberari quam necari? [23] Quid autem acerbum aut nimis grave est in homines tanti facinoris convictos? [24] Sin, quia levius est, qui convenit in minore negotio legem timere, cum eam in maiore neglexeris?

[25] At enim quis reprehendet, quod in parricidas rei publicae decretum erit? Tempus, dies, fortuna, cuius libido gentibus moderatur. Illis merito accidet, quicquid evenerit; 26 ceterum vos patres conscripti, quid in alios statuatis, considerate! [27] Omnia mala exempla ex rebus bonis orta sunt. Sed ubi imperium ad ignaros eius aut minus bonos pervenit, novum illud exemplum ab dignis et idoneis ad indignos et non idoneos transfertur.

[28] **Lacedaemonii devictis Atheniensibus** triginta viros inposuere, qui rem publicam eorum tractarent. [29] Ii primo coepere pessimum quemque et omnibus invisum indemnatum necare: ea populus laetari et merito dicere fieri. [30] Post, ubi paulatim licentia crevit, iuxta bonos et malos lubidinosse interficere, ceteros metu terrere: [31] ita civitas servitute oppressa stultae laetitiae gravis poenas dedit.

[32] **Nostra memoria** victor Sulla cum Damasippum et alios eius modi, qui malo rei publicae creverant, iugulari iussit, quis non factum eius laudabat? Homines scelestos et factiosos, qui seditionibus rem publicam exagitaverant, merito necatos aiebant. [33] Sed ea res magnae initium cladis fuit. Nam uti quisque domum aut villam, postremo vas aut

vestmentum alicuius concupiverat, dabat operam, ut is in proscriptorum numero esset. [34] Ita illi, quibus Damasippi mors laetitiae fuerat, paulo post ipsi trahebantur neque prius finis iugulandi fuit, quam Sulla omnis suos divitiis explevit. [35] Atque ego haec non in M. Tullio neque his temporibus vereor; sed in magna civitate multa et varia ingenia sunt. [36] Potest alio tempore, alio consule, cui item exercitus in manu sit, falsum aliquid pro vero credi. Ubi hoc exemplo per senatus decretum consul gladium eduxerit, quis illi finem statuet aut quis moderabitur?

[37] Maiores nostri, patres conscripti, neque consili neque audaciae umquam eguere; neque illis superbia obstat, quo minus aliena instituta, si modo proba erant, imitentur. [38] Arma atque tela militaria ab Samnitibus, insignia magistratuum ab Tuscis pleraque sumpserunt. Postremo, quod ubique apud socios aut hostis idoneum videbatur, cum summo studio domi exsequabantur: imitari quam invidere bonis malebant. [39] **Sed eodem illo tempore** Graeciae morem imitati verberibus animadvortebant in civis, de condemnatis summum supplicium sumebant. [40] Postquam res publica adolevit et multitudo civium factiones valere, circumveniri innocentes, alia huiusce modi fieri coepere, tum lex Porcia aliaeque leges paratae sunt, quibus legibus exsilium damnatis permissum est. [41] Hanc ego causam, patres conscripti, quo minus novum consilium capiamus, in primis magnam puto. [42] Profecto virtus atque sapientia maior illis fuit, qui ex parvis opibus tantum imperium fecere, quam in nobis, qui ea bene parta vix retinemus.

[43] Placet igitur eos dimitti et augeri exercitum Catilinae? Minime. Sed ita censeo: publicandas eorum pecunias, ipsos in vinculis habendos per municipia, quae maxime opibus valent; neu quis de iis postea ad senatum referat neve cum populo agat; qui aliter fecerit, senatum existumare eum contra rem publicam et salutem omnium facturum.

A Select Bibliography

- Aili, H. 1979. *The Prose Rhythm of Sallust and Livy*. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International.
- Albrecht, M. von. 1989. *Masters of Roman Prose from Cato to Apuleius: Interpretive Studies*. Translated by Neil Adkin, Francis Cairns.
- Eden, P. 1962. "Caesar's Style: Inheritance versus Intelligence," *Glotta*, vol. 40, no. 1, ser. 2, pp. 74–117.
- Groot, A.W. de. 1919a, *A Handbook of Antique Prose-Rhythm*. Wolters.
 _____ 1919b, *De numero oratorio latino commentatio*. Gronin
 _____ 1921. *Der antike Prosarhythmus*. Groningen: Wolters.
 _____ 1926. *La prose métrique des anciens*. Société d'édition.
- Fraenkel, E. 1964. "Nachträge zu 'Kolon und Satz' II" In E. Fraenkel, *Kleine Beiträge zur klassischen Philologie*. 2 vols. Rome. 1: 131-39
- Knox. B.M.W. 1968. "Silent Reading in Antiquity," *GRBS* 9. pp. 421-35.
- Oberhelman, S. M. 2003. *Prose Rhythm in Latin Literature of the Roman Empire: First Century B.C. to Fourth Century A.D.* Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen.
- Ullman, R. 1925. "Les clausules dans les discours de Salluste, Tite-Live et Tacite," *Symbolae Osloenses* 3, pp. 65-75
- Ramsey, J.T. 2007a. "Roman Senatorial Oratory." *A Companion to Roman Rhetoric*, edited by William J. Dominik and Jon Hall, Blackwell, pp. 122–135.
- Riggsby, A. M. 2006. *Caesar in Gaul and Rome: War in Words*. University of Texas Press.