**Lycurgus' Extreme Wisdom: Competing Views of the Lawgiver**

**in Plato and Xenophon**

Susan O. Shapiro CAMWS 2022

Susan.O.Shapiro@usu.edu Thursday, March 24 Session IB

Link to Abstract:

[Lycurgus' Extreme Wisdom: Competing Views of the Lawgiver in Plato and Xenophon](https://camws.org/sites/default/files/meeting2022/2602XenophonPlatoLycurgus.pdf)

**Example 1: Plato criticizes Xenophon**

**1a.** **Xenophon's *Education of Cyrus*** (c. 360 BC): a hagiographic and idealized account of the upbringing and education of Cyrus the Great.

**1b.** **Plato's *Laws*** (c. 347 BC) 694c6-8:

The Athenian: Μαντεύομαι δὴ νῦν περί γε Κύρου τὰ μὲν ἄλλ’ αὐτὸν στρατηγόν τε ἀγαθὸν εἶναι καὶ φιλόπολιν, **παιδείας δὲ ὀρθῆς οὐχ ἧφθαι τὸ παράπαν** . . .

The Athenian: Now in regards to Cyrus, I think he was a good general and he loved his country, **but he did not have a good education at all** . . .

**Example 2: Xenophon criticizes Plato**

**2a. Plato's *Symposium*** (c. 380 BC)

-Phaedrus (178e2-179b2): says that an army composed of lovers would be unbeatable because each soldier would act bravely in the presence of his beloved.

-Pausanias (181c2-182a10): praises lifelong love between men and boys.

**2b. Xenophon's *Symposium*** (360s BC)

-Socrates (8.32-34): says that Pausanias was wrong to praise an army of lovers because sexual relations are inappropriate among members of a fighting force.

**3a. Diotima's Speech on Eros as the Desire for Immortality**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Part 5: Physical Love**(207a5-208b6) | **Part 6: Love of Body and Soul**(208b7-209e4) - children  | **Part 7: Ladder of Wisdom**(209e5-212c3) - love objects |
|   |
| 8. The Form of Beauty |
|  |
| 7. The Single Knowledge of Beauty |
|  |
| 6. The Beauty of All Knowledge --> endless philosophical discourse |
|  |
| 5. The Beauty of Branches of Knowledge |
|  |  |
| Laws & Customs (Lycurgus and Solon) | 4. The Beauty of Laws and Customs |
|  |  |
| Poems(Homer and Hesiod) | 3. The Beauty of Body and Soul |
|  |  |
|  | 2. All Beautiful Bodies |
| Virtuous Logoi |  |
| Humans |  | 1. One Beautiful Body |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| Animals |  |  |

Physical love Love of another's body and soul Love of wisdom

produces another self produces cultural creations & produces immortality of the

 immortal fame after death soul.

**3b. Xenophon's *Constitution of the Spartans*** (360s BC): 1.1-2

1) Ἀλλ’ ἐγω ἐννοήσας ποτὲ ὡς **ἡ Σπάρτη** . . . **δυνατωτάτη τε καὶ ὀνομαστοτάτη ἐν τῇ ῾Ελλάδι ἐφάνη**, ἐθαύμασα ὅτῳ ποτὲ τρόπῳ τοῦτ’ ἐγένετο· ἐπεὶ μέντοι κατενόησα τὰ ἐπιτηδεύματα τῶν Σπαρτιατῶν, οὐκέτι ἐθαύμαζον. (2) **Λυκοῦργον** μέντοι τὸν θέντα αὐτοῖς τοὺς νόμους, οἷς πειθόμενοι ηὐδαιμόνησαν, τοῦτον καὶ **θαυμάζω καὶ εἰς τὰ ἔσχατα σοφὸν ἡγοῦμαι.** ἐκεῖνος . . . προέχουσαν εὐδαιμονίᾳ τὴν πατρίδα ἐπέδειξεν.

(1) Once, when I was considering how **Sparta . . . became the most powerful and the most famous polis in Hellas**, I wondered how this happened. But when I considered the social institutions of the Spartiates, I no longer wondered. (2) Nevertheless I do wonder at **Lycurgus**, who established the laws for them, in obedience to which they flourished, and **I consider him wise to the extreme (εἰς τὰ ἔσχατα σοφὸν).** For he . . . made his fatherland outstanding in prosperity.

4. The Greeks identified **moderation** **and** **self-restraint** with **wisdom**, and anything **extreme** **or excessive** with **folly**:

 **a. Homer:**

-King Alcinoos (*Odyssey* 7.310): ἀμείνω δ’ αἴσιμα πάντα "Moderation in all things is best."

-Menelaus (*Odyssey* 15.71): ἀμείνω δ’ αἴσιμα πάντα "Moderation in all things is best."

**b. Hesiod** (*WD* 38-40): βασιλῆας δωροφάγους . . . νήπιοι, οὐδὲ ἴσασιν ὅσῳ πλέον ἥμισυ παντός.

-"gift-devouring kings . . . fools, who do not know how much greater the half is than the whole."

**c. Pindar** (*Isth*. 8.25-26): τοῦ μὲν ἀντίθεοι . . υἱέες . . . σωφρονές τ’ἐγένοντο πινυτοί τε θυμόν.

-His godlike sons . . . were self-restrained and wise of spirit.

**d. Seven Sages' Proverbs** (Diels-Kranz):

μέτρον ἄριστον. Measure is best.

μηδὲν ἄγαν. Nothing in excess.

ἡ γλῶσσά σου μὴ προτρεχέτω τοῦ νοῦ. Don't let your tongue outrun your mind.

θυμοῦ κράτει. Control your spirit.

βλαβερὸν ἀκρασία. Lack of self-restraint is harmful.

μέτρῳ χρῶ. Live according to measure.

**e. Xenophon** (*Memorabilia* 3.9.4): [ὁ Σωκράτης] σοφίαν δὲ καὶ σωφροσύνην οὐ διώριζεν.

-Socrates did not distinguish between wisdom and self-restraint.

**f. Plato** (*Protagoras* 332a-333b): ὁ Σωκράτης· Οὐκοῦν ἓν ἄν εἴη ἡ σωφροσύνη καὶ ἡ σοφία;

-Socrates: Isn't it the case that self-restraint and wisdom are one thing?

**Select Bibliography**

Blondell, Ruby. 2006. "Where is Socrates on the 'Ladder of Love'?" In Lesher, Nails, and Sheffield, eds. Pp. 147-178.

Danzig, Gabriel. 2003. "Did Plato read Xenophon's *Cyropaedia*?" In Scolnicov and Brisson, eds. *The Laws: Selected Papers from the VI Symposium Platonicum*. Pp. 286-297.

Danzig, Gabriel. 2005. "Intra-Socratic Polemics: The *Symposia* of Plato and Xenophon." *GRBS* 45: 331-357.

Danzig, Gabriel. 2018. "Introduction to the Comparative Study of Plato and Xenophon." In Danzig, Johnson, and Morrison, eds. Pp. 1-29.

Danzig, Gabriel, David Johnson, and Donald Morrison, eds. 2018. *Plato and Xenophon: Comparative Studies*. Brill.

David, Ephraim. 2020. "Xenophon and the Myth of Lykourgos." In Powell, Anton and Nicolas Richer, eds. *Xenophon and Sparta*. Classical Press of Wales. Pp. 203-221.

Destrée, Pierre and Zina Giannopoulou, eds. 2017. *Plato's Symposium: A Critical Guide*. Cambridge University Press.

Dover, Sir Kenneth. 1965. "The Date of Plato's *Symposium*." *Phronesis* 10: 2-20.

Dover, Sir Kenneth, ed. 1980. *Plato: Symposium*. Cambridge University Press.

Due, Bodil. 1989. *The Cyropaedia: Xenophon's Aims and Methods*. Aarhus University Press.

Gray, Vivienne. 1992. "Xenophon's *Symposium*: The Display of Wisdom." *Hermes* 120: 58-75.

Hobden Fiona. 2020. *Xenophon*. Bloomsbury Academic.

Hobden and Tuplin, eds. 2012. *Xenophon: Ethical Principles and Historical Inquiry*. Brill.

Humble, Noreen. 1999. "Sōphrosynē and the Spartans in Xenophon." In Hodkinson and Powell, eds. *Sparta: New Perspectives*. Classical Press of Wales. Pp. 339-353.

Humble, Noreen. 2018. "Sparta in Xenophon and Plato." In Danzig, Johnson, and Morrison, eds. Pp. 547-575.

Huss, Bernhard. 1999a. "The Dancing Socrates and the Laughing Xenophon, or the Other *Symposium*." *AJP* 120: 381-409.

Huss, Bernhard. 1999b. *Xenophons Symposion: Ein Kommentar*. Teubner.

Johnson, David M. 2018. "Xenophon's Intertextual Socrates." In Danzig, Johnson, and Morrison, eds. Pp. 71-98.

Lesher, Nails, and Sheffield, eds. 2006. *Plato's Symposium: Issues in Interpretation and Reception*. Washington, DC: Center for Hellenic Studies.

Lipka, Michael. 2002. *Xenophon's Spartan Constitution: Introduction. Text. Commentary*. de Gruyter.

North, Helen. 1966. *Sophrosyne: Self-Knowledge and Self-Restraint in Greek Literature*. Cornell University Press.

Rademaker, Adriaan Maarten. 2005. *Sophrosyne and the Rhetoric of Self-Restraint: Polysemy and Persuasive Use of an Ancient Greek Value Term*. Brill.

Scott, Gary Alan and William A. Welton. 2008. *Erotic Wisdom: Philosophy and Intermediacy in Plato's Symposium*. SUNY Press.

Sheffield, Frisbee C. C. 2001. "Psychic Pregnancy and Platonic Epistemology." *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy* 20: 1-33.

Thesleff, Holger. 1978. "The Interrelation and Date of the Symposia of Plato and Xenophon." *Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies* 25: 157-170.

White, F. C. 2004. "Virtue in Plato's Symposium*." Classical Quarterly* 54.2: 366-378.