

Interactive Praise of Syracusan Musical Culture in Pindar's Olympian 1 and Bacchylides 5

1. Alleged Poetic Rivalry between Pindar and Bacchylides:

Pindar Nemean 3.80-82

ἔστι δ' αἰετὸς ὠκὺς ἐν ποτανοῖς,
ὃς ἔλαβεν αἶψα, τηλόθε μεταμαιομένος,
δαφοινὸν ἄγρην ποσίν·
κραγέται δὲ κολιοῖοι ταπεινὰ νέμονται

Swift is the eagle among birds, which suddenly
seizes, as it searches from afar, the bloodied
prey in its talons, while the cawing jackdaws
range down below (Transl. Race 1997)

(Scholia to Nem.3.143= Dr.iii62):

οἱ δὲ ἀντίτεχνοί μου κολιοῖοις εἰκόμασι, κραυγάζοντες μόνον καὶ ταπεινὰ νεμόμενοι, οὐ δύνανται
δὲ διαίρεσθαι εἰς ὕψος. **δοκεῖ δὲ ταῦτα τείνειν εἰς Βακχυλίδην· ἦν γὰρ ὑφόρασις αὐτοῖς
πρὸς ἀλλήλους.** παραβάλλει δὲ αὐτὸν μὲν αἰετῶ, κολιοῖω δὲ Βακχυλίδην.

“My rivals in craft are like jackdaws, only shouting out aloud and living in low regions. They cannot lift themselves up into sublimity”. **This appears to refer to Bacchylides. For they had feelings of ill will against each other.** He compares himself to an eagle, and Bacchylides to a jackdaw.”

Pindar Olympian .2.86-88¹

σοφὸς ὁ πολλὰ εἰδὼς φυᾶ·
μαθόντες δὲ λάβροι
παγγλωσσία κόρακες ὡς ἄκραντα γαρυέτων
Διὸς πρὸς ὄρνιχα θεῖον

The wise man knows many things innately. But
those who have learned chatter garrulously, like
two crows do in vain, when they face the divine
bird of Zeus

(Scholia to Ol.2.154c= Dr. iii98-99.):

ἀποτείνεται δὲ πρὸς τὸν Βακχυλίδην· γέγονε γὰρ αὐτῶ ἀνταγωνιστῆς τρόπον τινὰ καὶ εἰς τὰ
αὐτὰ καθῆκεν

He alludes to Bacchylides. For Bacchylides is his competitor in a certain way and fits these very same criteria

(Scholia to Olympian.2.157a=iii 99 Dr):

οἶον, ὡς κόρακες πρὸς αἰετὸν ἀντιβοῶντες οὕτως οἱ μαθόντες πρὸς τὸν φύσει σοφόν. **αἰνίττεται
Βακχυλίδην καὶ Σιμωνίδην, ἑαυτὸν λέγων αἰετὸν, κόρακας δὲ τοὺς ἀντιτέχνους**

Because, like crows shrieking back at an eagle, just so do learned people address the man who is wise by nature. He **alludes Bacchylides and Simonides, calling himself an eagle, and them who rival him in craft, crows**

¹ Translations of Pindar are based on Race 1997. Translations of Bacchylides are based on Campbell 2006.

2. Musical Culture at Hieron's court in Syracuse: Hosting Poets

Simonides: Praise

Athenaeus 14.656e: "Simonides was in fact a true cheapskate and a moneygrubber, according to Chamaeleon. In Syracuse, for example, Hieron used to send him lavish supplies to cover his day-to-day needs, but Simonides sold most of what he was sent and kept only a tiny portion for himself." (Translation, Olson 2007 Loeb)

Scholia to Theocritus 1.65/66a

Aetna is a mountain in Sicily, named after Aitne, daughter of Okeanos and Gaia, as Alkimos explains in his History of Sicily (FGrHist 560 F 5). Simonides recounts that Aitne settled a dispute between Hephaistos and Demeter concerning whom the territory belonged to. (Translation, Poltera 2008)

Scholia to Pindar, Olympian 2 (with Morgan 2015): Simonides reconciles Hieron with Theron of Akragas (*dubious?*)

Aeschylus: Drama

Evidence for travel to Sicily:

'*Vita Aeschyli*' in the codices MBVQ of Aeschylus, paragraphs 8-11,17, 18, (alleged motives for Aeschylus' departure(s) from Athens)

Plutarch, *Vita Cimonis* 8, 483 f; *De Exilio* 13-14, 604e-605b. see further Herington 1967: 82-85

1. Between Spring 472 and Spring 467: Production of 'Persae' at Hieron's invitation in Syracuse 'σπουδάσαντος Ἱέρωνος' (Testimonia no. 6- Herington)

2. Production of *Aitnaiai* in connection with Hieron's founding of Aetna (476?)- date for foundation given by Diodorus

"he went to Syracuse at the time Hieron was founding Aitna and he put on the Aitnai auguring a good life for those settling the city"

Macrobius, *Saturnalia* 5.19.24: quoting from Aeschylus *Aitnaia* (supposedly) - quote alludes to a pair of Sicilian deities- Paliki

A. What name then will mortals give to them?

B. Zeus bids [us] to call them the holy Palici.

A. And does the name of the Palici remain well chosen?

B. Yes, for they have returned from the darkness into the light.

3. Aristophanes scholium to *Peace* 73 notes Aeschylus' knowledge of big beetles that frequented Mt. Aetna

Epicharmus: Comedy

Scholia to Pindar, Pythian 1(99a): Epicharmus' "Islands" alludes to Hieron preventing Anaxias of Rhegion's destruction of Western Locri

Scholion to Aeschylus' Eumenides (626 = Epicharm. PCG fr. 221): Epicharmus ridiculed him for his frequent use of the verb τιμαλφεῖν ("honor"),

Surviving Titles of 3 plays: Persians Epinikios Choreuontes

Logos and Logina: Alluding to Pindar's *Olympian* 1?

Fragment 76 (PCG)

—Zeus invited me to a banquet (g'eranon) he's giving for Pelops.

—That's really terrible food, my friend, a crane (geranos).

—I didn't say a crane (geranon), I said a banquet

Xenophanes: Philosophy, Rhapsody

Plutarch (Mor.175b-c): DK 21B11: Hiero, who succeeded Gelon in the tyranny, said he was not disturbed by any that freely spoke against him. **To Xenophanes** the Colophonian, who said he had much ado to maintain two servants, he replied: But Homer, whom you disparage, maintains above ten thousand, although he is dead.

He **fined Epicharmus** the comedian, for speaking unseemly when his wife was by.

Elegy 1 (stressing sumptuous equipment and improving discourse: DK 21B1): linked to sympotic context in Hieron's palace

Pindar:

Epinicia

Olympian 1, *Pythian* 1, 2, 3

Hyporchemata

Fr.105ab(scholia to Nemean 7.1), Fr. 106

Encomia

124d, Philodemus on music

125 Athenaeus

126

Bacchylides:

Epinicia

Odes 3,4,5

Encomia

20C

3. Explanations for Verbal, Semantic & Thematic overlap in poems for Hieron's *Keles* victory at 476 BCE (*Olympian* 1 & Bacchylides 5):

1. 'Accidental' - Bacchylides and Pindar are good praise poets. They know how to praise Hieron "instinctively".

2. Praise mandated by commissioner: Hieron gave orders (orally? in writing? herald/epistle?)

3. Poets attending each other's earlier performances (e.g. Pindar's *Pythian* 6 at Akragas, 490 BCE, Dithyrambic competitions at Athens)

4. Face-to-Face interaction between Pindar and Bacchylides (e.g. meeting at Panhellenic festivals, Hieron's court, Macedonian court - Bacchylides frg. 20 & Pindar frg. 120 both for Alexander, son of Amyntas)

3A. Encomiastic Verbal Overlap in 476 BCE

Bacchylides 5.1-16

Εὖμοιρε [Σ]υρακ[οσίω]ν
ἵπποδινήτων στρατα[γ]έ,
γνώση μὲν [ι]οστεφάνων
Μοισᾶν γλυκ[ύ]δωρον ἄγαλμα, τῶν γε νῦν
αἶ τις ἐπιχθονίων, ὀρ-
θῶς· φρένα δ' εὐθύδικ[ο]ν
ἀτρέμ' ἀμπαύσας μεριμνᾶν
δεῦρ' <ἄγ'> ἄθρησον νόφ·
ἧ σὺν Χαρίτεσσι βαθυζώνοις ὑφά-
νας ὕμνον ἀπὸ ζαθέας
νάσου ξένος ὑμετέραν
πέμπει κλεένναν ἐς πόλιν,
χρυσάμπυκος Οὐρανίας
κλεινὸς θεράπων· ἐθέλει
δὲ γάρυον ἐκ στηθέων χέων
αἰνεῖν Ἴέρωνα.

Pindar, Olympian 1, 103-111

πέποιθα δὲ ξένον
μή τιν' ἀμφότερα καλῶν τε ἴδριν ἴᾶ-
μα καὶ δύναμιν κυριώτερον
τῶν γε νῦν κλυταῖσι δαιδαλωσέμεν ὕμνων πτυχαῖς.
θεὸς ἐπίτροπος ἐὼν τεαῖσι μῆδεται
ἔχων τοῦτο κᾶδος, Ἴέρων,
μερίμναισιν· εἰ δὲ μὴ ταχὺ λίποι,
ἔτι γλυκυτέραν κεν ἔλπομαι
σὺν ἄρματι θεῶ κλει-
ξιν ἐπίκουρον εὐρῶν ὁδὸν λόγων
παρ' εὐδείελον ἐλθὼν Κρόνιον. ἐμοὶ μὲν ὦν
Μοῖσα καρτερώτατον βέλος ἀλκᾶ τρέφει·

Musical Connoisseurship + Sole Rulership:

Ol.1.103-4: ξένον μή τιν' ἀμφότερα **καλῶν τε ἴδριν ἴᾶμα καὶ δύναμιν κυριώτερον**
B.5.2-6: **στρατα[γ]έ... γνώση... Μοισᾶν γλυκ[ύ]δωρον ἄγαλμα** τῶν γε νῦν **αἶ τις ἐπιχθονίων, ὀρθῶς**).

Poetry as finely woven hymns for Hieron :

Ol.1.105 δαιδαλωσέμεν **ὕμνων πτυχαῖς**; B.5.9-10 ὑφάνας **ὕμνον**

Conventional Xenia: Ol.1.103 ξένον; B.5.11 ξένος

Glorification inspired by the Muse(s):

Ol.1.110-112: ἔλπομαι σὺν ἄρματι θεῶ **κλειῖξιν** ἐμοὶ... **Μοῖσα** καρτερώτατον βέλος ἀλκᾶ τρέφει
B.5:11-14:ξένος ὑμετέραν /πέμπει **κλεένναν** ἐς πόλιν/χρυσάμπυκος **Οὐρανίας** /**κλεινὸς** θεράπων

3B. Interactive Praise of Musical Culture at Syracuse

Pindar, *Olympian* 1.7-17

μηδ' Ὀλυμπίας ἀγῶνα φέρτερον αὐδάσομεν·
ὄθεν ὁ πολύφατος ὕμνος ἀμφιβάλλεται
σοφῶν μητίεσι, κελαδεῖν
Κρόνου παῖδ' ἐς ἀφνεὰν ἰκομένους
μάκαιραν Ἰέρωνος ἐστίαν,
θεμιστεῖον ὃς ἀμφέπει σκᾶπτον ἐν πολυμήλῳ
Σικελία δρέπων μὲν κορυφὰς ἀρετῶν ἄπο πασῶν,
ἀγλαΐζεται δὲ καὶ
μουσικᾶς ἐν ἀώτῳ,
οἷα παίζομεν φίλαν
ἄνδρες ἀμφὶ θαμὰ τράπεζαν.

nor let us proclaim a contest greater than Olympia. From there comes the famous hymn that encompasses the thoughts of wise men, who have come in celebration of Cronus' son to the rich and blessed hearth of Hieron, who wields the rightful scepter in flock-rich Sicily. He culls the summits of all achievements and is also glorified in the finest songs, such as those we men often perform in play about the friendly table

Travelling Poets/Travelling poetry:

Olympian 1.8-11

ὄθεν ὁ πολύφατος ὕμνος ἀμφιβάλλεται
σοφῶν μητίεσι, κελαδεῖν
Κρόνου παῖδ' ἐς ἀφνεὰν ἰκομένους
μάκαιραν Ἰέρωνος ἐστίαν

Bacchylides 5.10-12:

ἢ σὺν Χαρίτεσσι βαθυζώνοις ὑφά-
νας ὕμνον ἀπὸ ζαθέας
νάσου ξένος ὑμετέραν
πέμπει κλεένναν ἐς πόλιν,
χρυσάμπυκος Οὐρανίας
κλεινὸς θεράπων

Poetic Agalmata:

Olympian 1.14-17

ἀγλαΐζεται δὲ καὶ
μουσικᾶς ἐν ἀώτῳ,
οἷα παίζομεν φίλαν
ἄνδρες ἀμφὶ θαμὰ τράπεζαν

Bacchylides 5.3-5

γνώση μὲν [ἰ]οστεφάνων
Μοισᾶν γλυκ[ύ]δωρον
ἄγαλμα, τῶν γε νῦν
αἴ τις ἐπιχθονίων, ὀρ-
θῶς

Justice, Kingship, Music, Hesiod:

Olympian 1.12

θεμιστεῖον ὃς ἀμφέπει σκᾶπτον ἐν πολυμήλῳ
Σικελία

Bacchylides 5.6-7...14-16

φρένα δ' εὐθύδικ[ο]ν
ἀτρέμ' ἀμπαύσας μεριμνᾶν...
ἐθέλει

δὲ γάρυν ἐκ στηθέων χέων
αἰνεῖν

Theogony 81-86

ὄντινα τιμήσουσι Διὸς κοῦραι μέγαλοιο
γεινόμενόν τε ἴδωσι διοτρεφέων βασιλῶν,
τῷ μὲν ἐπὶ γλώσση γλυκερὴν χεῖουσιν ἔερσην,
τοῦ δ' ἔπε' ἐκ στόματος ῥεῖ μέλιχα· οἱ δὲ νυ λαοὶ
πάντες ἐς αὐτὸν ὀρώσι διακρίνοντα θέμιστας
ἰθειῆσι δίκησιν·

Theogony 94-103:

ἐκ γάρ τοι Μουσέων καὶ ἐκηβόλου Ἀπόλλωνος
ἄνδρες αἰδοῖοι ἔασιν ἐπὶ χθόνα καὶ κιθαρισταί,
ἐκ δὲ Διὸς βασιλῆς· ὁ δ' ὄλβιος, ὄντινα Μοῦσαι
φίλωνται· γλυκερὴ οἱ ἀπὸ στόματος ῥεεῖ αὐδή.
εἰ γάρ τις καὶ πένθος ἔχων νεοκηδέϊ θυμῷ
ἄζηται κραδίην ἀκαχήμενος, αὐτὰρ αἰδοῖος
Μουσάων θεράπων κλεῖα προτέρων ἀνθρώπων
ὕμνησει μάκαράς τε θεοὺς οἱ Ὀλυμπον ἔχουσιν,
αἴψ' ὃ γε δυσφροσυνέων ἐπιλήθεται οὐδέ τι κηδέων
μέμνηται· ταχέως δὲ παρέτραπε δῶρα θεῶν.

81-86: Whomever among Zeus-nourished **kings the daughters of great Zeus honor** and behold when he is born, **they pour sweet dew upon his tongue**, and his words flow soothingly from his mouth. All the populace look to him as **he decides disputes with straight judgments**.

94-103: **For it is from the Muses** and far-shooting Apollo **that men are poets** upon the earth and lyre players, but it is from Zeus that they are kings; and **that man is blessed, whomever the Muses love, for the speech flows sweet from his mouth**. Even if someone who has unhappiness in his newly anguished spirit is parched in his heart with grieving, **yet when a poet, servant of the Muses, sings** of the glorious deeds of people of old and the blessed gods who possess Olympus, **he forgets his sorrows at once and does not remember his anguish at all;** for quickly the gifts of the goddesses have turned it aside (Most 2018)

4. Musical Chariot rides

Bacchylides 5.176-186

Λευκώλενε Καλλιόπα,
σταῶσον εὐποίητον ἄρμα
αὐτοῦ· Δία τε Κρονίδαν
ὑμνησον Ὀλύμπιον ἀρχαγὸν θεῶν,
τόν τ' ἀκαμαντοροῶν Ἄλ-
φεόν, Πέλοπός τε βίαν,
καὶ Πίσαν ἔνθ' ὁ κλεεννὸς
[πο]σσι νικάσας δρόμῳ
[ἦλθ]εν Φερένικος <ἐς> εὐπύργους Συρα-
κόσσας Ἴέρωνι φέρων
[εὐδ]αιμονίας πέταλον.

White-armed Calliope, halt your well-made chariot here: sing in praise of Zeus, son of Cronus, Olympian, ruler of gods, and of Alpheus, tireless stream, and of the might of Pelops, and of Pisa, where famous Pherenicus sped to victory in the race and so returned to well-towered Syracuse bringing Hiero the leaves of good fortune.

Olympian 1.106-112

θεὸς ἐπίτροπος ἐὼν τεαῖσι μήδεται
ἔχων τοῦτο κᾶδος, Ἴέρων,
μερίμναισιν· εἰ δὲ μὴ ταχὺ λίποι,
ἔτι γλυκυτέραν κεν ἔλπομαι
σὺν ἄρματι θεῶ κλει-
ξιν ἐπίκουρον εὐρὼν ὁδὸν λόγων
παρ' εὐδείελον ἐλθὼν Κρόνιον. ἐμοὶ μὲν ὦν
Μοῖσα καρτερώτατον βέλος ἀλκᾷ τρέφει·

A god acting as guardian makes this his concern: to devise means, Hieron, for your aspirations, and unless he should suddenly depart, I hope to celebrate an even sweeter success with a speeding chariot, having found a helpful road of words when coming to Cronus' sunny hill. And now for me the Muse tends the strongest weapon in assistance

Select Bibliography

- Athanassaki, L. 2012. "Performance and Re-Performance: The Siphnian Treasury Evoked (Pindar's Pythian 6, Olympian 2 and Isthmian 2)." In Agócs, P., Carey, C., and Rawles, R. eds. *Reading the Victory Ode*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press. 134–57.
- Campbell, D.A., ed. 2006. *Bacchylides, Corinna and Others*. Reprinted. Greek Lyric ed. and transl. by David A. Campbell; 4. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard Univ. Press.
- Calame, C. 2012. "Metaphorical Travel and Ritual Performance in Epinician Poetry." In Agócs, P., Carey, C., and Rawles, R. eds. *Reading the Victory Ode*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press. 303–20.
- Diels, H., and W. Kranz, eds. 1961/1952. *Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker*. 3 vols. 10th ed. Berlin: Weidmann
- Drachmann, A.B., ed. 1997. *Scholia in Nemeonicas et Isthmionicas. Epimetrum. Indices. Scholia vetera in Pindari carmina*. Stuttgart: Teubner.
- Herington, C.J. 1967. "Aeschylus in Sicily." *The Journal of Hellenic Studies* 87: 74–85.
- Jacoby, F. 1923–1958. *Die Fragmente der Griechischen Historiker*. Berlin: Weidmann.
- Kassel, R., and C. Austin. 1983. *Poetae comici graeci*. 8 vols. Berlin: de Gruyter.
- Kurke, L. 2013. "Pindar's Pythian 11 and the Oresteia: Contestatory Ritual Poetics in the 5th c. BCE." *Classical Antiquity* 32 (1): 101–75.
- Lefkowitz, M.R. 1969. "Bacchylides' Ode 5: Imitation and Originality." *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 73: 45–96.
- Lefkowitz, M.R. 1991. *First-Person Fictions: Pindar's Poetic "I."* Oxford : New York: Clarendon Press ; Oxford University Press
- Maehler, H. 1982. *Die Lieder Des Bakchylides*. Mnemosyne, Bibliotheca Classica Batava 62. Leiden: E.J. Brill
- Morgan, K.A. 2015. *Pindar and the Construction of Syracusan Monarchy in the Fifth Century B.C.* Greeks Overseas. Oxford New York Auckland Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Morrison, A. 2007. "Performances and Audiences In Pindar's Sicilian Victory Odes." *Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies. Supplement* (95): iii–146
- Most, G.W., ed. 2018. *Hesiod: Theogony, Works and Days, Testimonia*. Revised edition. Loeb Classical Library LCL 57, LCL 503. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Most, G. 2012. "Poet and Public: Communicative Strategies in Pindar and Bacchylides." In Agócs, P., Carey, C., and Rawles, R. eds. *Reading the Victory Ode*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press. 249–77
- Nisetich, F.J. 1975. "Olympian 1.8-11: An Epinician Metaphor." *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 79: 55–68.
- Poltera, O. 2008. *Simonides Lyricus, Testimonia Und Fragmente: Einleitung, Kritische Ausgabe, Übersetzung Und Kommentar*. Schweizerische Beiträge Zur Altertumswissenschaft Bd. 35. Basel: Schwabe.
- Race, W.H. 1997. *Pindar: Olympian Odes, Pythian Odes*. The Loeb Classical Library 56, 485. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.