

Arrian, Quintilian, and the Contest for Authority

Nikola Golubović, University of Pennsylvania

nikolag@sas.upenn.edu

1. Arrian's letter to Lucius Gellius:

Ἀρριανὸς Λουκίῳ Γελλίῳ χαίρειν. Οὐτε συνέγραψα ἐγὼ τοὺς Ἐπικτήτου λόγους οὕτως ὅπως ἂν τις συγγράψει τὰ τοιαῦτα οὔτε ἐξήνεγκα εἰς ἀνθρώπους αὐτός, ὅς γε οὐδὲ συγγράψαι φημί. ὅσα δὲ ἤκουον αὐτοῦ λέγοντος, ταῦτα αὐτὰ ἐπειράθην αὐτοῖς ὀνόμασιν ὡς οἶόν τε ἦν γραψάμενος ὑπομνήματα εἰς ὕστερον ἐμαυτῷ διαφυλάξαι τῆς ἐκείνου διανοίας καὶ παρρησίας. ἔστι δὴ τοιαῦτα ὡσπερ εἰκὸς ὅποια ἂν τις αὐτόθεν ὀρμηθεὶς εἴποι πρὸς ἕτερον, οὐχ ὅποια ἂν ἐπὶ τῷ ὕστερον ἐντυγχάνειν τινὰς αὐτοῖς συγγράφοι. τοιαῦτα δ' ὄντα οὐκ οἶδα ὅπως οὔτε ἐκόντος ἐμοῦ οὔτε εἰδότος ἐξέπεσεν εἰς ἀνθρώπους. ἀλλ' ἐμοὶ γε οὐ πολὺς λόγος, εἰ οὐχ ἱκανὸς φανοῦμαι συγγράφειν, Ἐπικτήτῳ τε οὐδ' ὀλίγος, εἰ καταφρονήσει τις αὐτοῦ τῶν λόγων, ἐπεὶ καὶ λέγων αὐτοὺς οὐδενὸς ἄλλου δῆλος ἦν ἐφιέμενος ὅτι μὴ κινήσει τὰς γνώμας τῶν ἀκουόντων πρὸς τὰ βέλτιστα. εἰ μὲν δὴ τοῦτό γε αὐτὸ διαπράττοντο οἱ λόγοι οὔτοι, ἔχοιεν ἂν οἶμαι ὅπερ χρῆ ἔχειν τοὺς τῶν φιλοσόφων λόγους· εἰ δὲ μή, ἀλλ' ἐκεῖνο ἴστωσαν οἱ ἐντυγχάνοντες ὅτι, αὐτὸς ὅποτε ἔλεγεν αὐτούς, ἀνάγκη ἦν τοῦτο πάσχειν τὸν ἀκροώμενον αὐτῶν ὅπερ ἐκεῖνος αὐτὸν παθεῖν ἠβούλετο. εἰ δ' οἱ λόγοι αὐτοὶ ἐφ' αὐτῶν τοῦτο οὐ διαπράττονται, τυχὸν μὲν ἐγὼ αἴτιος, τυχὸν δὲ καὶ ἀνάγκη οὕτως ἔχειν. ἔρρωσο.

Arrian sends greetings to Lucius Gellius. I have not composed the discourses of Epictetus as someone might compose such works, nor have I brought them out into the world of my own accord, indeed I declare I have not composed them at all. Yet the very things I heard him speak, in their precise words as much as it was possible, I have tried to preserve in writing for my own future use as recordings of his way of thinking and his bluntness. Therefore, these are, as it is to be expected, such remarks as someone might say to another spontaneously, not such as someone would compose for a future chance audience. Given their character, I do not know how they have fallen into the people's hands without my will and knowledge. But it is of no great concern to me if I shall seem an inadequate composer of works, and to Epictetus of no concern at all if someone will scorn his discourses, because even as he was speaking them it was obvious that he was aiming at nothing else than to move the minds of his listeners toward the best things. If these discourses would accomplish that same effect, I believe they would have exactly what discourses of philosophers ought to have. If not, then let those who come across them know that whenever Epictetus spoke them, their listener had no choice but to feel what Epictetus wanted him to feel. If the discourses by themselves do not accomplish that, perhaps I am to blame, or perhaps this is inevitably so. Farewell.

2. Quintilian's letter to Trypho (1 *Praef.* 7–10):

<p>duo iam sub nomine meo libri ferebantur artis rhetoricae neque editi a me neque in hoc comparati. Namque alterum sermonem per biduum habitum pueri quibus id praestabatur exceperant, alterum pluribus sane diebus, quantum notando consequi potuerant, interceptum boni iuvenes sed nimium amantes mei temerario editionis honore vulgaverant. Quare in his quoque libris erunt eadem aliqua, multa mutata, plurima adiecta, omnia vero compositiora et quantum nos poterimus elaborata.</p>	<p>Two books on the art of rhetoric were already circulating under my name, though they were never given out by me nor prepared for this purpose. One is a two days' lecture course which was taken down by the slaves assigned to this task. The other lecture course, which spread over rather more days, was recorded – as much as they could manage in writing – by some excellent young men who were nevertheless too fond of me, and therefore rashly honored it with publication and wide circulation. In the present work, therefore, there will be some things the same, many things changed, and very many things added, and the whole will be better written and worked up to the best of my ability.</p>
--	--

3. Parallels between the two letters:

οὔτε συνέγραψα ἐγὼ τοὺς Ἐπικτήτου λόγους ... οὔτε ἐξήνεγκα εἰς ἀνθρώπους αὐτός.	duo iam sub nomine meo <u>libri</u> ferebantur artis rhetoricae <u>neque editi a me</u>
ὅπως ἂν τις συγγράψει τὰ τοιαῦτα.	neque <u>in hoc comparati</u>
οὔτε ἐκόντος ἐμοῦ οὔτε εἰδότος	neque editi a me neque in hoc comparati
ὅσα δὲ ἤκουον αὐτοῦ λέγοντος	<u>namque</u> alterum <u>sermonem</u> per biduum habitum
ταῦτα αὐτὰ ἐπειράθην αὐτοῖς ὀνόμασιν ... <u>διαφυλάξαι</u>	<u>sermonem</u> ... pueri quibus id praestabatur <u>exceperant</u> ... <u>interceptum</u>
ὡς οἷόν τε ἦν γραψάμενος	quantum notando consequi potuerant
ἐξέπεσεν εἰς ἀνθρώπους	temerario editionis honore vulgaverant
ὅποια ἂν τις αὐτόθεν ὀρηθεὶς εἶποι πρὸς ἕτερον	sermonem per biduum habitum ... alterum pluribus sane diebus
ὅποια ἂν ἐπὶ τῷ ὕστερον ἐντυγχάνειν τινὰς αὐτοῖς συγγράφοι	temerario <u>editionis</u> honore
οὐδενὸς ἄλλου δῆλος ἦν ἐφιέμενος ὅτι μὴ <u>κινήσαι</u> τὰς γνώμας τῶν ἀκουόντων πρὸς τὰ <u>βέλτιστα</u>	ideoque non dicendi modo eximiam in eo facultatem <u>sed omnis animi virtutes exigimus.</u>
εἰ οὐχ ἰκανὸς φανοῦμαι <u>συγγράφειν</u> ... <u>τυχὸν μὲν ἐγὼ αἴτιος</u>	omnia vero <u>compositiora</u> et <u>quantum nos poterimus</u> elaborata

4. Quintilian on the primacy of rhetoric over philosophy:

Neque enim hoc concesserim, rationem rectae honestaeque vitae, ut quidam putaverunt, ad philosophos relegandam, cum vir ille vere civilis et publicarum privatarumque rerum administrationi accommodatus, qui regere consiliis urbes, fundare legibus, emendare iudiciis possit, non alius sit profecto quam orator.	I cannot agree that the principles of upright and honorable living should, as some have held, be left to the philosophers. The man who can really play his part as a citizen, who is fit for the management of public and private business, and who can guide cities by his counsel, give them a firm basis by his laws, and put them right by his judgements, is surely no other than an orator.
--	---

5. Parallels involving ethical considerations:

ἔχοιεν ἂν οἶμαι ὅπερ χρὴ ἔχειν τοὺς τῶν φιλοσόφων λόγους ... αὐτὸς ὅποτε ἔλεγεν αὐτοὺς ἀνάγκη ἦν τοῦτο πάσχειν τὸν ἀκροώμενον αὐτῶν ὅπερ ἐκεῖνος αὐτὸν παθεῖν ἠβούλετο.	<u>neque enim hoc concesserim</u> , rationem rectae honestaeque vitae, ut quidam putaverunt, ad <u>philosophos</u> relegandam ... non alius sit profecto quam <u>orator</u> .
---	---

6. Bibliography:

- Boter, Gerard. 2017. "From Discourses to Handbook: The *Encheiridion* of Epictetus as a Practical Guide to Life." In *Knowledge, Text and Practice in Ancient Technical Writing*, edited by Marco Formisano and Philip J. van der Eijk, 163–85. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Dobbin, Robert F. 1998. *Epictetus, Discourses: Book I*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Janson, Tore. 1964. *Latin Prose Prefaces: Studies in Literary Conventions*. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell.
- Long, A. A. 2002. *Epictetus: A Stoic and Socratic Guide to Life*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Sherwin-White, A. N. 1957. "Pliny's Praetorship Again." *The Journal of Roman Studies* 47 (1–2): 126–30.
- Stadter, Philip A. 1980. *Arrian of Nicomedia*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- Whitton, Christopher. 2019. *The Arts of Imitation in Latin Prose: Pliny's Epistles/Quintilian in Brief*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wirth, Theo. 1967. "Arrians Erinnerungen an Epiktet." *Museum Helveticum* 24 (3): 149–89.