

Thucydides 1.22 (to accompany CAMWS talk 27 March 2015 by Clayton Miles Lehmann)

(22) καὶ ὅσα μὲν λόγῳ εἶπον ἕκαστοι ἢ μέλλοντες πολεμήσειν ἢ ἐν αὐτῷ ἤδη ὄντες, χαλεπὸν τὴν ἀκρίβειαν αὐτῆν τῶν λεχθέντων διαμνημονεῦσαι ἦν ἐμοὶ τε ὧν αὐτὸς ἤκουσα καὶ τοῖς ἄλλοθεν ποθεν ἐμοὶ ἀπαγγέλλουσιν· ὡς δ' ἂν ἐδόκουν ἐμοὶ ἕκαστοι περὶ τῶν αἰεὶ παρόντων τὰ δέοντα μάλιστα εἰπεῖν, ἐχομένῳ ὅτι ἐγγύτατα τῆς ξυμπάσης γνώμης τῶν ἀληθῶς λεχθέντων, οὕτως εἴρηται. (2) τὰ δ' ἔργα τῶν πραχθέντων ἐν τῷ πολέμῳ οὐκ ἐκ τοῦ παρατυχόντος πυθανόμενος ἠξίωσα γράφειν, οὐδ' ὡς ἐμοὶ ἐδόκει, ἀλλ' οἷς τε αὐτὸς παρῆν καὶ παρὰ τῶν ἄλλων ὅσον δυνατὸν ἀκριβεῖα περὶ ἐκάστου ἐπεξελεθῶν. (3) ἐπιπόνως δὲ ἠύρισκετο, διότι οἱ παρόντες τοῖς ἔργοις ἐκάστοις οὐ ταῦτα περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν ἔλεγον, ἀλλ' ὡς ἐκατέρων τις εὐνοίας ἢ μνήμης ἔχοι. (4) καὶ ἐς μὲν ἀκρόασιν ἴσως τὸ μὴ μυθῶδες αὐτῶν ἀτερπέστερον φανεῖται· ὅσοι δὲ βουλήσονται τῶν τε γενομένων τὸ σαφές σκοπεῖν καὶ τῶν μελλόντων ποτὲ αὐθις κατὰ τὸ ἀνθρώπινον τοιούτων καὶ παραπλησίων ἔσεσθαι, ὠφέλιμα κρίνειν αὐτὰ ἀρκούντως ἔξει. κτῆμά τε ἐς αἰεὶ μᾶλλον ἢ ἀγώνισμα ἐς τὸ παραχρήμα ἀκούειν ζύγκεται.

(22) The words uttered by individual speakers, both before they went to war and once they were engaged in it, could not easily be recorded with accuracy either by me in cases where I heard the speech myself or by those making reports to me from the various places. The speeches here represent what in my judgment it would have been most important for the individual speakers to say with regard to the current circumstances, while keeping as closely as possible to the general sense of what was actually said. (2) The actions performed in the war I did not think it right to narrate on the basis of chance informants or in accordance with my own judgment, but on the basis of my own presence in some cases and on the most precise investigation possible of what I could learn from others about each event. (3) The search

As for all the things each (of the speakers) said in a speech when they were either about to go to war or were already involved in it, it was impossible to remember distinctly the exact wording of the things that were said, both for me of what I had heard myself and for those who reported to me from somewhere else. However, as I thought that each (of the speakers) most likely might have said the things that were required on the issues facing them at any given time, in this way they have been presented (by me) in the speeches, keeping as closely as possible to the whole reasoning of the things that had been actually said.

Eckart Schütrumpf, *Philologus* 155 (2011): 229-56 at 231-32.

In this history I have made use of set speeches some of which were delivered just before and others during the war. I have found it difficult to remember the precise words used in the speeches which I listened to myself and my various informants have experienced the same difficulty; so my method has been, while keeping as closely as possible to the general sense of the words that were actually used, to make the speakers say what, in my opinion, was called for by each situation.

Rex Warner (1954)

With reference to the speeches in this history, some were delivered before the war began, others while it was going on; some I heard myself, others I got from various quarters; it was in all cases difficult to carry them word for word in one's memory, so my habit has been to make the speakers say what was in my opinion demanded of them by the various occasions, of course adhering as closely as possible to the general sense of what they really said.

Richard Crawley (1866)

Ed and trans P J Rhodes, *Thucydides "History" I*, Aris and Phillips Classical Texts (Warminster: Aris & Phillips, Ltd, 2014).

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Collingwood, R G. *The Idea of History*. Rev ed by Jan van der Dussen. Oxford: Oxford Univ Press, 1994.
- Connor, W R. "A Post Modernist Thucydides?" *The Classical Journal* 72.4 (1977): 289-98.
- De Romilly, Jacqueline. *The Mind of Thucydides*. Trans Elizabeth Trapnell Rawlings. Ed Hunter R Rawlings III and Jeffrey S Rusten. Cornell Studies in Classical Philology. Ithaca and London: Cornell Univ Press, 2012.
- De Ste Croix, G E M. *The Origins of the Peloponnesian War*. Ithaca and New York: Cornell University Press, 1972.
- Edmunds, Lowell. *Chance and Intelligence in Thucydides*. Cambridge: Harvard Univ Press, 1975.
- Fornara, Charles. *The Nature of History in Ancient Greece and Rome*. Eidos: Studies in Classical Kinds. Berkeley, Los Angeles, and London: Univ of California Press, 1983.
- Gomme, A W. *A Historical Commentary on Thucydides*. Vol 1. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1945.
- Hornblower, Simon. *Thucydides*. London: Duckworth, 1987.
- _____. *A Commentary on Thucydides*. 2 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991.
- Kagan, Donald. "The Speeches in Thucydides and the Mytilene Debate." *YCS* 24 (1975): 71-94.
- Loraux, Nicole. "Thucydides Is Not a Colleague." In *Greek and Roman Historiography*, ed John Marincola, 19-39. Oxford Readings in Classical Studies. Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ Press, 2011.
- Luschnat, Otto. *RE* 12 suppl (1970), sv "Thukidides," 1162-83.
- Macaulay, Thomas Babington. "History" (1828). In *Critical, Historical, and Miscellaneous Essays*, 376-432. Vol 1. New York: A C Armstrong & Son, 1860.
- Marincola, John. "Speeches in Classical Historiography." In *A Companion to Greek and Roman Historiography*, ed id, 2 vols, 1: 118-32. Malden, Oxford, and Carlton: Blackwell Publishing, 2007.
- Ober, Josiah. "Thucydides and the Invention of Political Science." In *Brill's Companion to Thucydides*, ed Antonios Rengakos and Antonis Tsakmakis, 1: 131-59. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2006.
- Porciani, Leone. "Come si scrivono i discorsi. Su Tucidide I 22, 1 ἄν . . . μάλιστα εἶπεῖν." *Quaderni di storia* 49 (199): 103-135.
- _____. "The Enigma of Discourse: A View of Thucydides." Trans Ginevra Adamoli and Kyle M Hall. In *A Companion to Greek and Roman Historiography*, ed John Marincola, 2 vols, 2: 328-35. Malden, Oxford, and Carlton: Blackwell Publishing, 2007.
- Rengakos, Antonios. "Thucydides' Narrative: The Epic and Herodotean Heritage." In *Brill's Companion to Thucydides*, ed Antonios Rengakos and Antonis Tsakmakis, 1: 279-300. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2006.
- Rhodes, P J. *Thucydides "History" I*. Aris and Phillips Classical Texts. Warminster: Aris & Phillips, Ltd, 2014.
- Rood, Tim. "Objectivity and Authority: Thucydides' Historical Method." In *Brill's Companion to Thucydides*, ed Antonios Rengakos and Antonis Tsakmakis, 1: 225-49. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2006.
- Rusten, J S, ed, Thucydides, *The Peloponnesian War Book II*. Cambridge, New York, and Melbourne: Cambridge Univ Press, 1989.
- Schütrumpf, Eckart. "As I thought that the speakers might most likely have spoken . . .": Thucydides *Hist* 1.22.1 on Composing Speeches." *Philologus* 155 (2011): 229-56.
- Walbank, Frank W. "Speeches in Greek Historians." In *Selected Papers: Studies in Greek and Roman History and Historiography*, 242-61. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ Press, 1985.
- Wilson, John. "What Does Thucydides Claim for His Speeches?" *Phoenix* 36.2 (1982): 95-103.