

Bloodthirsty Scholarship: Responses to Death in the Scholia to the *Iliad*

1. οἶμαι δὲ καὶ τὴν Ὀμήρου ποίησιν μείζω λαβεῖν δόξαν, ὅτι καλῶς τοὺς πολεμήσαντας τοῖς βαρβάροις ἐνεκωμίασε, καὶ διὰ τοῦτο βουλευθῆναι τοὺς προγόνους ἡμῶν ἐντιμον αὐτοῦ ποιῆσαι τὴν τέχνην ἐν τε τοῖς τῆς μουσικῆς ἄθλοις καὶ τῇ παιδεύσει τῶν νεωτέρων, ἵνα πολλάκις ἀκούοντες τῶν ἐπῶν ἐκμανθάνωμεν τὴν ἔχθραν τὴν ὑπάρχουσαν πρὸς αὐτούς, καὶ ζηλοῦντες τὰς ἀρετὰς τῶν στρατευσαμένων τῶν αὐτῶν ἔργων ἐκείνοις ἐπιθυμῶμεν.

Moreover, I think that even the poetry of Homer has won a greater renown because he has nobly glorified the men who fought against the barbarians, and that on this account our ancestors determined to give his art a place of honor in our musical contests and in the education of our youth, in order that we, hearing his verses over and over again, may learn by heart the enmity which stands from of old between us and them, and that we, admiring the valor of those who were in the war against Troy, may conceive a passion for like deeds. (Isoc. 5.159, trans. G. Norlin)

2. Ἐνθ' ἔβαλ' Ἀνθεμίωνος υἱὸν Τελαμώνιος Αἴας
ἠΐθεον θαλερὸν Σιμοείσιον, ὃν ποτε μήτηρ
Ἴδηθεν κατιοῦσα παρ' ὄχθησιν Σιμόεντος
γαίνατ', ἐπεὶ ῥα τοκεῦσιν ἄμ' ἔσπετο μῆλα ιδέσθαι.
τοῦνεκά μιν κάλεον Σιμοείσιον· οὐδὲ τοκεῦσι
θρέπτρα φίλοις ἀπέδωκε, μινυνθάδιος δέ οἱ αἰὼν
ἔπλεθ' ὑπ' Αἴαντος μεγαθύμου δουρὶ δαμέντι.
πρῶτον γάρ μιν ἰόντα βάλε στῆθος παρὰ μαζὸν
δεξιόν· ἀντικρὺ δὲ δι' ὤμου χάλκεον ἔγχος
ἦλθεν· ὃ δ' ἐν κονίησι χαμαὶ πέσεν αἰγείρος ὡς
ἦ ῥά τ' ἐν εἰάμενῃ ἔλεος μέγαλοιο πεφύκει
λείη, ἀτάρ τέ οἱ ὄζοι ἐπ' ἀκροτάτῃ πεφύασι...

There Telamonian Aias struck down the son of Anthemion Simoeisios in his stripling's beauty, whom once his mother descending from Ida bore beside the banks of Simoeis when she had followed her father and mother to tend the sheepflocks. Therefore they called him Simoeisios; but he could not render again the care of his dear parents; he was short-lived, beaten down beneath the spear of high-hearted Aias, who struck him as he first came forward beside the nipple of the right breast, and the bronze spearhead drove clean through the shoulder. He dropped then to the ground in the dust, like some black poplar, which in the land low-lying about a great marsh grows smooth trimmed yet with branches growing at the uttermost tree-top... (*Il.* 4.473-84, trans. Lattimore)

3. SIMOISIUS born on the banks of the Simois
Son of Anthemion his mother a shepherdess
Still following the sheep when she gave birth
A lithe and promising young man unmarried
Was met by Ajax in the ninth year of the war
And died full tilt running onto his spear
The point passed clean through the nipple
And came out through the shoulderblade
He collapsed instantly an unspeakable sorrow to his parents. (Oswald 15)

4. ἵνα τὰ ἐγκώμια τῶν Ἑλλήνων πιθανώτερα ποιήσῃ. ἐπεὶ δὲ ἔμελλε νικῶντας ἀποφαίνειν τοὺς Ἑλληνας, εἰκότως τοῦ κατατρέχει ἀξιοπιστότερον ἔκ τοῦ μὴ πάντα χαρίζεσθαι τῷ ἐκείνων ἐπαίνῳ.

[He begins with the word “wrath”] so that he might make the encomia of the Greeks more persuasive. Since he was about to show the Greeks conquering, it is reasonable that he does [not throw aside believability?] by indulging in praise of them at all points. (Schol. AT 1.1a, 6-8)

5. ὡς φιλέλλην δὲ καὶ τοὺς τρεῖς τοὺς ἀπολωλότας πολλοὺς εἶναι δοκεῖ .

As a philhellene, even the three that were killed seem to be many. (Schol. bT 7.17-18, 3-4).

6. ὁ δ' οὐτάσεν Ἴλιονῆα
υἷὸν Φόρβαντος πολυμήλου, τὸν ῥα μάλιστα
Ἑρμείας Τρώων ἐφίλει καὶ κτήσιν ὅπασσε·
τῷ δ' ἄρ' ὑπὸ μήτηρ μῶνον τέκεν Ἴλιονῆα.
τὸν τόθ' ὑπ' ὀφρύος οὐτα κατ' ὀφθαλμοῖο θέμεθλα,
ἐκ δ' ὥσε γλήνην: δόρυ δ' ὀφθαλμοῖο διαπρὸ
καὶ διὰ ἰνίου ἦλθεν, ὁ δ' ἔζετο χεῖρε πετάσσας
ἄμφω: Πηνέλεως δὲ ἐρυσσάμενος ξίφος ὀξὺ
ἀνχένα μέσσον ἔλασσεν, ἀπήραξεν δὲ χαμᾶζε
αὐτῇ σὺν πῆληκι κάρη: ἔτι δ' ὄβριμον ἔγχος
ἦεν ἐν ὀφθαλμῷ.

[Peneleos] then stabbed with the spear Ilioneus the son of Phorbas the rich in sheepflocks, whom beyond all men of the Trojans Hermes loved, and gave him possessions. Ilioneus was the only child his mother had borne him. This man Peneleos caught underneath the brow, at the bases of the eye, and pushed the eyeball out, and the spear went clean through the eye-socket and tendon of the neck, so that he went down backward, reaching out both hands, but Peneleos drawing his sharp sword hewed at the neck in the middle, and so dashed downward the head, with helm upon it, while still on the point of the big spear the eyeball stuck. (*Iliad* 14.489-99)

7. εἰς τὸ παθητικὸν αὐτὸν μόνον φησὶ γενέσθαι τῷ πατρί, κα τᾶλλα αὐτῷ εὔ ἔχειν πράγματα· τετιμῆσθαι γὰρ ὑπὸ Ἑρμοῦ. συνιστᾶς οὖν τοὺς ἀναιρουμένους θεραπεύει τοὺς ἀνελόντας.

For the sake of pathetic effect, [Homer] says that he alone was born to his father, and that his other affairs were good; for he was honored by Hermes. Indeed, in building up those killed, he serves the killers. (Schol. bT 14.492)

- 8 a. οὐδεὶς Ἑλλήνων τοιοῦτος. εἰσὶν οὖν πλούτῳ μᾶλλον ἢ δυνάμει ἐναβρυνόμενοι.

None of the Greeks is like this. For these two glory in their wealth rather than in their strength. (Schol. bT 11.131)

- b. εἰς εὐσέβειαν δὲ ἡμᾶς παρακαλεῖ, τὸν ἐξ ἀσεβείας χρηματισάμενον στερίσκων τῶν παίδων.

He encourages us to be pious, by depriving of his children a man made wealthy by impiety. (Schol. bT 11.132)

- c. οἰκεία ἢ κόλασις τῷ τοῦ πατρὸς ἀδικήματι· κεφαλή τε γὰρ ἀποτέμενεται ἢ φθεγξαμένη γνώμην πονηρὰν καὶ χεῖρες, αἷς τὸν χρυσὸν ἔλαβεν.

The punishment is appropriate for the injustice of the father. For the head, which spoke a wicked opinion, is cut off, as are the hands with which he received the gold. (Schol. bT 11.146)

9. λεκτέον δὲ ὅτι, εἰ μὲν ἐλέγετο ταῦτα πρὸ τῆς ἐπιorkίας, ἔγκλημα ἂν ἦν· ἐπεὶ δὲ μετὰ τοὺς ὄρκους καὶ τὴν παράβασιν, οὐκ ἐπαχθῆς Ἀγαμέμνων· σχεδὸν γὰρ καὶ ὁ ἀκροατὴς τοῦτο βούλεται, τὸ μηδὲ γένος ἐπιλιμπάνεσθαι τῶν ἐπιόρκων. σχεδὸν οὖν ὑπὲρ τῶν θεῶν ὀργίζεται.

...But it is to be said that, if he had said these things before the oath-breaking, it would have been a [valid] accusation; but since [he says them] after the oaths and their transgression, Agamemnon is not liable. One might say that the reader wishes the same thing, that nothing would be left of the race of the oath-breakers. One might say he is angry on behalf of the gods. (Schol. bT 6.58-59b, 7-11)

10. δούπησεν δὲ πεσὼν, ἀράβησε δὲ τεύχε' ἐπ' αὐτῷ.
αἶματί οἱ δεύοντο κόμαι Χαρίτεσσιν ὁμοῖαι
πλοχμοὶ θ', οἱ χρυσοῦ τε καὶ ἀργύρου ἐσφήκωντο.
οἶον δὲ τρέφει ἔρνος ἀνὴρ ἐριθηλὲς ἐλαίης
χώρῳ ἐν οἰοπόλῳ, ὅθ' ἄλις ἀναβέβροχεν ὕδωρ,
καλὸν τηλεθάον· τὸ δὲ τε πνοιᾶ δονέουσι
παντοίων ἀνέμων, καὶ τε βρῦει ἄνθει λευκῷ.
ἐλθὼν δ' ἐξαπίνης ἄνεμος σὺν λαίλαπι πολλῇ
βόθρου τ' ἐξέστρεψε καὶ ἐξετάνυσσ' ἐπὶ γαίῃ.

He fell, thunderously, and his armour clattered upon him,
and his hair, lovely as the Graces, was splattered with blood, those
braided locks caught waspwise in gold and silver. As some
slip of an olive tree strong-growing that a man raises
in a lonely place, and drenched it with generous water, so that
it blossoms into beauty, and the blasts of winds from all quarters
tremble it, and it bursts into pale blossoming. But then
a wind suddenly in a great tempest descending upon it
wrenches it out of its stand and lays it at length on the ground. (*Iliad* 17.49-58)

11. a. Οὐκ εἰκῆ ἢ ἐπεξεργασία τῆς κόμης· ἀλλ' ἐπεὶ ἔφθη εἰπὼν “μιάνθησαν δὲ ἔθειραι / αἶματι καὶ κονίησι...” παραμυθίαν εἰσφέρει τοῖς λυπομένοις ὑπὲρ Πατρόκλου, ψευδεῖς ἀντιπαραθεῖς τρίχας ταῖς οὐ ψευδέσιν.

This elaboration of the hair is not at random; but since he said before “the plumes above it were defiled / by blood and dust...” he brings consolation to those grieving over Patroclus, contrasting the false hair with the real. (Schol. bT 17.51a1)

- b. ... εἰς ἐκδικίαν καὶ παραμυθίαν, ὡς εἴποι τις, παρέλαβε καὶ τὴν Εὐφόρβου κόμην.

... He took also the hair of Euphorbus, for revenge and consolation. (Schol. A 17.51a2)

Bibliography

- Bouchard, E. 2012. “Audience, Poetic Justice, and Aesthetic Value in Aristotle’s *Poetics*.” In *Aesthetic Value in Classical Antiquity*, ed. I. Sluiter and R. Rosen. Leiden: Brill. 183-214.
- Erbse, H. 1969. *Scholiorum Graecorum in Homeri Iliadem*. 7 vols. Berlin: De Gruyter.
- Griffin, J. 1976. “Homeric Pathos and Objectivity.” *CQ* 26, no. 2: 161-187.
- Nunlist, R. 2009. *The Ancient Critic at Work*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Oswald, A. 2011. *Memorial: An Excavation of the Iliad*. London: Faber and Faber.
- Schein, S. 1976. “The Death of Simoeisios: *Iliad* 4.473-489. *Eranos* 74: 1-5.
- Schmidt, M. 2011. “Portrait of an Unknown Scholiast.” In *Ancient Scholarship and Grammar: Archetypes, Concepts and Contexts*, ed. S. Matthaios, F. Montanari, and A. Rengakos. De Gruyter. 119-58.
- _____. 2002. “The Homer of the Scholia: What Is Explained to the Reader?” *Omero Tremila Anni Dopo*. Ed. F. Montanari. Rome. 159-83.
- Van Der Valk, M. 1953. “Homer’s Nationalistic Attitude.” *L’Antiquité Classique* 22: 5-26.
- Weil, S. 1965. “The Iliad, or the Poem of Force.” Translated by Mary McCarthy. *Chicago Review* 18, no. 2: 5-30. First published 1940.
- Wilson, N. 2007. “Scholiasts and Commentators.” *GRBS* 47: 39–70.